| **Student Name:** Davian |
| --- |

| **Motion**: THW create an organ and tissue market in which individuals are legally able to sell their organs and tissues to registered buyers. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Competition Score: | 72 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * You had a really good hook! Nice work on zoning in on the comparative immediately. * Try to make sure that you match the situation in your hook with your tone; I think a tone of seriousness and urgency would have worked really well at the beginning.   Model   * Who is going to regulate this market? Which part of the government? How will the government make sure that the organs are not black market organs, etc? * Good set though re: the types of organs that we will sell and not sell. * Good signposting Davian!   1st: High demand of organs   * I think an important piece of context that you could add here is that currently there are not enough organ donors - which means that there is a super high demand for organs. Your other reasons were fine, but this is one of the more compelling reasons! * Remember that you also need to prove that you will dismantle the black market; will the black market become smaller because people don’t need to exclusively go through them anymore? * I think you could also go into a bit more characterisation of the people who will be selling; what type of situation might they be in? How desperate might they be? Does that desperation justify the sale of their organ? Why so? Perhaps you can mention that people can decide for themselves; meaning that if someone’s life is in such a crisis that money is all they prioritise, we should allow them to pursue the sale of their organs. * Good comparative; but make sure that you are taking into account the best case of the opposition. The opposition’s best case is that they can protect the poor and vulnerable + destroy the black markets.   2nd: Fair.   * Good identification of the other side's point; try to tell me how exactly this is going to be the case though! * Taking away their rights; are you sure you’re taking away their rights? Or are you enhancing a right? One could think that you actually enhance the right to bodily autonomy! * I think the issue of high demand organs wasn't quite dealt with; make sure that you detail how the market will work in terms of safety next time around!   Speaking time: 06:45.43, good work! Let’s hit the 7 minute mark next time. | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Bea |
| --- |

| **Motion**: THW create an organ and tissue market in which individuals are legally able to sell their organs and tissues to registered buyers. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Nice start. I love the dramatism and tone in your speech! Try to match the tone with your volume though; I think a sharper + louder tone would have been perfect! * Rebuttals   + Excellent call-out regarding how this is not going to be an informed choice; I think you can actually go further to say that look, people cannot possibly predict a life without organs - because you don’t know what you are okay with until you go through with it. The problem with organ donation is that it’s likely to be permanent.   + Try to rebut the argument about destroying the black market! This was a huge chunk of the Prop’s case.   + I like the anger I’m seeing in this speech! * Argument 1: Co-ercion and influence   + Try not to take the POI mid argument! Complete what you wanna say then go for it.   + Try to make sure that you first tell me why nobody can reasonably consent to an organ sale; what type of desperate situations are we talking about?   + What is the harm of reducing someone to a commodity? Is it the case that the government and the state no longer cares or tries to uplift people, because we see them as expandable body parts?   + I feel that a motion like this is one that really needs illustrations; you gotta show me the full horrors of what proposition is about to release. This is horror to an extent of people being permanently maimed and disfigured for the sake of money.   + Try to make sure that you’re actively impacting! Try to give me as many reasons as possible to show that the money isn’t worth it.   Speaking time: 04:25.76, good work! | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Oscar |
| --- |

| **Motion**: THW create an organ and tissue market in which individuals are legally able to sell their organs and tissues to registered buyers. |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 71 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:   * Nice hook! Excellent emotional tone. I love that illustration of families dying waiting for organs. * Rebuttals   + You want to first explain just how extreme these situations are; people are not just going to sell their organs for nothing. These are people who are desperate enough that they are willing to maim themselves. Also, a good angle is that this is going to happen anyway under the black market!   + Hope; why is hope valuable? Remember that you gotta make sure to explain what this new life is going to look like?   + Try to also call out the other speaker if they aren’t responding to you!   Argument 1: Patients can find organs and survive   * I think at this point there’s clearly a clash in terms of who to prioritise; the people who need the organs and the people who sell the organs. In your mind, why are the people who need to buy organs so important to an extent whereby we need to make sure that people have access to the legal market. * Remember to explain the how of things; e.g., it’s logical for you to suggest that the black market suffers, but I’m not sure if this will actually happen in the real world. Try to draw some comparisons to things like the legalisation of recreational drugs in western countries since the logic is closely attached! * Remember to talk about the right you are upholding and why that right is super important.   Speaking time: 04:05.89, good work! Let’s aim for 5 next time. | | | | | | |